## Section 2.3b Out-Of-Step Protection

## Section 2.3.4 Out-of-Step Protection - Application

All impedance values are in per unit on 100 MVA base. All angles are in degrees.

## System Data

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
Z_{g s}:=0.05 & \begin{array}{l}
\text { impedance and } \\
\text { impedance angle of } \\
\text { generator at bus } \mathrm{S}
\end{array} \\
\theta 1_{1}:=90 \mathrm{deg} & \begin{array}{l}
\text { Line impedance and } \\
\text { impedance angle }
\end{array} \\
Z_{s r}:=1.3 & \begin{array}{l}
\text { Impedance and } \\
\text { impedance angle of }
\end{array} \\
\theta 2_{2}:=75 \mathrm{deg} & \begin{array}{l}
\text { generator at bus } \mathbf{R}
\end{array} \\
Z_{r h}:=0.05 & \begin{array}{l}
\text { angular momentum of } \\
\text { generator at bus } \mathbf{R}
\end{array} \\
\theta 3_{3}:=90 \mathrm{deg} & \begin{array}{l}
\text { angular momentum of } \\
\text { generator at bus } \mathbf{S}
\end{array} \\
M_{r}:=4 & \begin{array}{l}
\text { transmitted steady state } \\
M_{s}:=5
\end{array} \\
P_{s s}:=0.61 & \text { power } \\
n:=1.0 & \text { ratio of VG over VH }
\end{array}
$$

## Relay Settings

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
T:=0.9 & \text { relay reach in percent of } \mathbf{S R} \\
\theta 4_{4}:=75 \mathrm{deg} & \text { relay maximum torque angle }
\end{array}
$$

## Fault

Characteristic

$$
t_{c}:=0.06 \quad \text { fault clearing time }
$$

## Method of Solution

The procedure to verify the coordination of the protection scheme at point $\mathbf{b}$ is as follows:
From the system data, a graph is obtained on the R-X plane of the relay characteristic and the system impedance. From the system impedance and source voltage, the swing ohms trajectory is obtained and plotted on the R-X plain along with the relay characteristic. This curve indicates the ohm value seen by the relay as a result of varying line conditions. It is independent of the system loading conditions (i.e. prefault power transfer and transmission angle). The intersections of this trajectory with the relay characteristic determine the values of the transmission angle for which swing ohms are within that characteristic. These are the entry and exit angles. A stable swing generally will remain in the relay characteristic for some time and then exit from its entry angle. On the other hand, an unstable swing will traverse the relay characteristic through its entry and exit angles.

The time the swing ohms remain in the relay characteristic are found by solving the system dynamic equation and obtaining the transmission angle response. The values of the transmission angle are compared against the entry and exit angle of the swing and the above time is determined. This procedure can help in selecting time delays for relay operation.

Equation (2.3.1) is a polar-to-rectangular conversion function that is used throughout the example.

$$
\begin{equation*}
r(\theta):=\cos (\theta)+1 \mathrm{j} \cdot \sin (\theta) \tag{2.3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Equations (2.3.2) to (2.3.4) allow the system impedance to be graphed on an impedance diagram along with the impedance-relay characteristic.

$$
\begin{align*}
& \theta 1_{1}:=\text { if }\left(\left\langle\theta 1_{1}=90 \mathrm{deg}\right), 88 \mathrm{deg}, \theta 1_{1}\right)  \tag{2.3.2}\\
& \theta 2_{2}:=\text { if }\left(\left\langle\theta 2_{2}=90 \mathrm{deg}\right), 88 \mathrm{deg}, \theta 2_{2}\right)  \tag{2.3.3}\\
& \theta 3_{3}:=\text { if }\left(\left\langle\theta 3_{3}=90 \mathrm{deg}\right), 88 \mathrm{deg}, \theta 3_{3}\right) \tag{2.3.4}
\end{align*}
$$

The following relationships convert the polar impedance values to rectangular form.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
z_{g s}:=Z_{g s} \cdot r\left(\theta 1_{l}\right) & z_{s r}:=Z_{s r} \cdot r\left(\theta 2_{2}\right) \\
z_{r h}:=Z_{r h} \cdot r\left(\theta 3_{3}\right) & z_{\text {relay }}:=T \cdot Z_{s r} \cdot r\left(\theta 4_{4}\right)
\end{array}
$$

Combine the generator and line impedances to get the total impedance.

$$
Z_{T}:=z_{s r}+z_{r h}+z_{g s}
$$

Define the R-X relay characteristic.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
Z_{r 0}:=\frac{z_{\text {relay }}}{2} & \text { center } \\
i:=0,2 . .360 & \text { index for system impedance plots }
\end{array}
$$

Offset the characteristic to pass through zero.

$$
Z_{r_{i}}:=\left|Z_{r 0}\right| \cdot r(i \cdot \operatorname{deg})+Z_{r 0}
$$

Define the system impedance as a piece-wise linear function so it can be shown on the $\mathrm{R}-\mathrm{X}$ diagram.

$$
\begin{align*}
& F_{1}(x):=\tan \left(\theta 1_{l}\right) \cdot x  \tag{2.3.5}\\
& F_{2}(x):=\tan \left(\theta 2_{2}\right) \cdot x  \tag{2.3.6}\\
& F_{3}(x):=\tan \left(\theta 3_{3}\right) \cdot\left(x-\operatorname{Re}\left(z_{s r}\right)\right)+\operatorname{Im}\left(z_{s r}\right) \tag{2.3.7}
\end{align*}
$$

$c_{1}:=0 \quad$ Used by following if statements to produce zero traces of system impedance on graphs.

Substitute Equations (2.3.5)-(2.3.7) to create the following piece-wise linear functions.

$$
\begin{align*}
& G_{l}(x):=\mathbf{i f}\left(\left(x<-\operatorname{Re}\left(z_{g s}\right)\right), c_{1}, F_{l}(x)\right)  \tag{2.3.8}\\
& G_{2}(x):=\mathbf{i f}\left((x<0), G_{l}(x), F_{2}(x)\right)  \tag{2.3.9}\\
& G_{3}(x):=\mathbf{i f}\left(\left(x<\operatorname{Re}\left(z_{s r}\right)\right), G_{2}(x), F_{3}(x)\right) \tag{2.3.10}
\end{align*}
$$

Create the line impedance function.

$$
\begin{align*}
& Z_{\text {line }}(x):=\mathbf{i f}\left(\left(x<\operatorname{Re}\left(z_{s r}+z_{r h}\right)\right), G_{3}(x), c_{l}\right)  \tag{2.3.11}\\
& x:=-0.2,-0.19 \ldots 0.4 \quad \text { range to plot }
\end{align*}
$$

## Line Impedance and Relay Characteristic

The figure below shows the relay characteristic with the line impedance superimposed. The maximum torque angle of the relay is assumed to be the same as the line impedance angle.


Fig. 2.3.2 Relay and system impedance plots

## Determine the Swing Ohm Trajectory

The swing ohm trajectory appears as a circle on an R-X diagram. The radius for this circle is given by

$$
\begin{align*}
& n:=\text { if }(n=1,0.999, n) \\
& R:=\frac{Z_{T} \cdot n}{n^{2}-1} \tag{2.3.12}
\end{align*}
$$

The if statement removes the singularity for a circle of infinite radius.

Define the trajectory of the swing ohms in rectangular form.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& c_{\text {swing }}:=Z_{T}+\frac{Z_{T}}{n^{2}-1}-z_{g s} \quad \text { center of the swing impedance circle } \\
& r_{\text {swing }}:=n \cdot \frac{\left|Z_{T}\right|}{\left|n^{2}-1\right|} \quad \text { radius of the swing impedance circle } \\
& Y_{\text {swing }}(s):=\left({\sqrt{r_{\text {swing }}}{ }^{2}-\operatorname{Re}\left(s-c_{\text {swing }}\right)^{2}}^{2}\right)+\operatorname{Im}\left(c_{\text {swing }}\right) \\
& x:=-0.5,-.45 . .0 .8 \quad \text { plot range }
\end{aligned}
$$



Fig 2.3.3 Plot of line Z, relay characteristic, and system swing ohms

## Determination of the Entry and Exit Angles

System power swings will follow the trajectory of the swing ohms plot. The intersections of this trajectory with the relay characteristic provide the relative rotor angles at the entry and exit of the swing through the relay characteristic. The intersection points, (xo, yo), are found using the following solve block:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left(x_{o}-\operatorname{Re}\left(c_{\text {swing }}\right)\right)^{2}+\left(y_{o}-\operatorname{Im}\left(c_{\text {swing }}\right)\right)^{2}=r_{\text {swing }} \\
& \left.\left(x_{o}-\operatorname{Re}\left(Z_{r 0}\right)\right)^{2}+\left(y_{o}-\operatorname{Im}\left(Z_{r 0}\right)\right)^{2}=\langle | Z_{r 0} \mid\right)^{2}
\end{aligned}
$$

Define a function $\operatorname{Int}(x 0, y o)$ of the intersection point coordinates, where xo and yo are the initial guesses of these points for the solve block.

$$
\operatorname{Intsct}\left(x_{o}, y_{o}\right):=\operatorname{Find}\left(x_{o}, y_{o}\right)
$$

Find the two intersection points by giving different initial guesses to Int.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
P_{1}:=\operatorname{Intsct}(0.4,0.2) & \text { intersection at entry of swing trajectory } \\
P_{2}:=\operatorname{Intsct}(-0.2,0.1) & \text { intersection at exit of swing trajectory } \\
P_{1}=\left[\begin{array}{l}
0.731 \\
0.486
\end{array}\right] & P_{2}=\left[\begin{array}{r}
-0.397 \\
0.769
\end{array}\right]
\end{array}
$$

Calculate the corresponding rotor angle at $\mathbf{P 1}$ and $\mathbf{P} 2$.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
O(P):=P_{0}+1 \mathrm{j} \cdot P_{1} & \text { polar impedance at intersections } \\
H:=z_{s r}+z_{r h} & \text { polar impedance between points } \mathbf{H} \text { and } \mathbf{R} \\
G:=-z_{g s} & \text { polar impedance between points } \mathbf{S} \text { and } \mathbf{G}
\end{array}
$$

Compute the value of power angle where the swing trajectory intersects the characteristics using the law of cosines:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \delta_{\text {int }}(P):=\operatorname{acos}\left(\frac{(|O(P)-G|)^{2}+(|O(P)-H|)^{2}-(|G-H|)^{2}}{2 \cdot((|O(P)-G|) \cdot|O(P)-H|)}\right) \\
& \delta_{1}:=\delta_{\text {int }}\left(P_{1}\right) \\
& \delta_{2}:=360 \mathrm{deg}-\delta_{\text {int }}\left(P_{2}\right) \\
& \begin{array}{lc} 
& \text { entry angle } \\
\delta_{1}=100.577 \mathrm{deg} & \text { exit angle }
\end{array} \\
& \delta_{2}=259.626 \mathrm{deg}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Computation of the Transient Response

After the swing entry and exit angles through the relay characteristic are determined, a transient simulation of the swing is computed. This simulation determines the time the swing ohms stay within the relay characteristic.

The steady-state power transfer determines the initial power angle of the system before the disturbance occurs.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\delta o_{o}:=\operatorname{asin}\left(\frac{P_{s s} \cdot\left|Z_{T}\right|}{n}\right) & \text { initial angle } \\
\frac{\delta o_{o}}{c}=\left(3.411 \cdot 10^{-9}\right) \frac{s}{m} &
\end{array}
$$

The equivalent angular momentum is

$$
\begin{aligned}
& M:=\frac{M_{r} \cdot M_{s}}{M_{r}+M_{s}} \\
& M=2.222
\end{aligned}
$$

A simple numerical integration is used to solve the differential equation describing the system.
Define the integration index.

$$
i:=1 . . .60
$$

Define the time step of the integration.

$$
d t:=0.01
$$

Define the initial conditions.
$\omega_{0}:=0.0$
$\omega_{1}:=0.0$
$\delta_{0}:=\delta o_{o}$
$\delta_{1}:=\delta o_{0} \quad t_{0}:=0.0 \quad t_{1}:=0.0$
$t:=i \cdot d t \quad$ increment time by the integration time interval

These are the coefficients of the Adams-Bashford two-step numerical integration formula. This formula will produce the solution to the system.

$$
h_{1}:=1.5 \cdot d t \quad h_{2}:=0.5 \cdot d t
$$

Define a function for power with respect to power angle and clearing time. Assuming a three-phase fault, the line power is zero during the fault. Therefore,

$$
P(\delta, t):=\mathbf{i f}\left(\left(t<t_{c}\right), 0,\left(n \cdot \frac{\sin (\delta)}{\left|Z_{T}\right|}\right)\right)
$$

## Solution of System State-Equations

Define the necessary parameters.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
D \delta(\omega):=377 \cdot \omega & \text { derivative of the rotor angle } \\
D \omega(\delta, t):=\frac{P_{s s}-P(\delta, t)}{M} & \text { derivative of the rotor speed }
\end{array}
$$

Integration formula for finding the change in frequency and power angle from the previous two derivatives:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \Delta \omega(\delta 1, \delta 2, t 1, t 2):=h_{1} \cdot D \omega(\delta 1, t 1)-h_{2} \cdot D \omega(\delta 2, t 2) \\
& \Delta \delta(\omega 1, \omega 2):=h_{1} \cdot D \delta(\omega 1)-h_{2} \cdot D \delta(\omega 2)
\end{aligned}
$$

Vectorize and solve.

$$
\left[\begin{array}{c}
\omega_{i+1} \\
\delta_{i+1}
\end{array}\right]:=\left[\begin{array}{c}
\omega_{i}+\Delta \omega\left(\delta_{i}, \delta_{i-1}, t_{i}, t_{i-1}\right) \\
\delta_{i}+\Delta \delta\left(\omega_{i}, \omega_{i-1}\right)
\end{array}\right]
$$

Plot the dynamic response of the system to determine the system stability and the time interval inside the relay trip region. This interval is determined by the time the relative rotor angle is between the entry and exit angles calculated previously.


Fig. 2.3.5 Dynamic response of the generator rotor angle
For the given system operating conditions and fault clearing time, the system generators remain stable. If the damping effects are included in the computations, the oscillations would decay to zero. The power swing causes the swing ohms to enter the relay characteristic and remain there for approximately 0.25 seconds. A blocking relay should be added to this system to improve the tripping selectivity of the protection scheme. The above time is greatly affected by the system inertia.

## Unstable System Operation

Different loading conditions may produce unstable operation. If the steady state power is increased as

$$
P_{s s}:=0.7
$$

then the system transient can be calculated again.

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\delta o_{o}:=\operatorname{asin}\left(\frac{P_{s s} \cdot\left|Z_{T}\right|}{n}\right) & \text { initial angle } \\
\frac{\delta o_{o}}{c}=\left(4.56 \cdot 10^{-9}\right) \frac{s}{m} &
\end{array}
$$

Define the initial conditions.
$\omega_{0}:=0.0$
$\omega_{1}:=0.0$
$\delta_{0}:=\delta o_{0}$
$\delta_{1}:=\delta o_{o}$
$t_{0}:=0.0$
$t_{1}:=0.0$

$$
t_{i}:=i \cdot d t \quad \text { increment time by the integration time interval }
$$

Vectorize and solve.

$$
\left[\begin{array}{c}
\omega_{i+1} \\
\delta_{i+1}
\end{array}\right]:=\left[\begin{array}{c}
\omega_{i}+\Delta \omega\left(\delta_{i}, \delta_{i-1}, t_{i}, t_{i-1}\right) \\
\delta_{i}+\Delta \delta\left(\omega_{i}, \omega_{i-1}\right)
\end{array}\right]
$$



Fig. 2.3.6 Unstable system response
For this case, the unstable swing enters the relay characteristic at $\mathrm{t}=0.13 \mathrm{sec}$ and exits at $\mathrm{t}=0.57 \mathrm{sec}$. Therefore, for the worst case of swing, the swing ohms remain in the relay characteristic for 0.44 sec .

